

## Transcript

### Episode 3.12

#### Book 3, Chapter 12: The Patronus

Caroline: You're listening to Harry Potter after 2020, an HP chapter reread podcast wherein two friends who read the books way back in the day as adults revisit the series through a post-2020 lens. Your hosts are Lorrie Kim, author of *Snape: The Definitive Analysis*, and JC, an educator and long-time HP fan. I'm your editor, Caroline. In this episode, Lorrie and JC tackle Book Three, Chapter Twelve: The Patronus.

Lorrie: The Patronus. Professor McGonagall takes away Harry's Firebolt for testing. Harry takes Patronus lessons with Professor Lupin, making up for the boggart lesson Lupin held back from him earlier in the term. Neville loses his list of passwords, and Scabbers goes missing. This is an important chapter. You ready to discuss this, JC?

JC: Yeah. I made a note to myself, right before I started reading: my pre-reading thoughts were that "I'm really excited to read this chapter again. I have such good memories of reading this the first time and seeing Harry make a connection with someone from his past. I wonder how it's going to feel this time." That was what I wrote down before I started, and that was my biggest memory of this chapter: Harry making that connection with Lupin and Lupin realizing what Harry sees when the dementors come near and how meaningful that was, even if Harry doesn't appreciate in the moment the depth of it. I cried reading this chapter and that surprised me, so we'll get to that.

Lorrie: Wow. You cried then, and/or now?

JC: Now. I don't remember crying when I read this before. This time, I was like \*wails\*.

Lorrie: Oh, wow, uh-huh. The first thing that stood out for me in this chapter was the single moment in the entire series that Hermione shows impatience with how the boys are slower (mentally) than she is when they're not talking, so she's really lost it with them. "Still looks ill, doesn't he? What d'you reckon's the matter with him?" This is about Lupin. "There was a loud and impatient 'tuh' from behind them. 'Well, isn't it obvious?'" That she packs all of her frustration into the word "tuh" is so precious to me. She holds it back so often, and Ron doesn't believe that she knows. But yeah, it takes a lot to get Hermione's patience on that front to fray.

JC: It's also interesting that because there's so much tension between the kids, if they had all been getting along, she might have told them what she knows about Lupin at this point. Now, she's not telling them almost out of spite, which says that she doesn't think Lupin's particularly dangerous.

Lorrie: Right.

JC: But she's figured it out. Yeah.

Lorrie: I'm thinking that she wouldn't have told them.

JC: Would not have? Interesting.

Lorrie: Right, because she's already keeping the secret with McGonagall about the Time-Turners, so she has entered this era of knowing that sometimes adults need you to trust them and to keep their secrets.

JC: Yeah. I guess yeah, that's probably true. Yeah. Certainly... In this book, she steps away from the boys a little bit. She's following her... what's the right word to say? Moral compass is not the right word for it, but that's as close as I can get. She's figuring out what's important to her and she's following that, even when she thinks her friends are not going to like it, or when she knows her friends are not going to like it and are going to punish her socially for following that moral compass. She's doing more of that in this book, which I think is really interesting.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: It's growing up. She's growing up!

Lorrie: She is.

JC: I do feel bad for her. The boys are ignoring her and she buries herself in all of her work, and I'm sure she's lonely and she's stressed; it's not a fun time for her.

Lorrie: It's a rough year. So did you notice anything else, before we get to the lesson?

JC: A lot of interesting little funny bits stood out to me. One of them was the idea of Oliver Wood being so horrified that Harry's broomstick has been confiscated that he's like, "I'm going to go talk to McGonagall." He's like, "I have to go and talk to her about this," and he's just so sure that Quidditch is more important than anything else.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: And then when he comes back later and he's like, "Oh, she was mad at me because I care about Quidditch more than 'other people's lives'," basically, and he doesn't understand why she's feeling this way. That was really funny. Another thing that stood out to me as funny is the bonfire full of salamanders in the Care of Magical Creatures. It sounds pretty horrific until you remember what kind of salamanders these are. "A bonfire of salamanders?!" All the little salamanders are scattering around, which is funny.

Lorrie: It's only a very slight variation on our world.

JC: Yeah. It's really funny. Then, the third thing that stands out to me is again, we have Professor Trelawney claiming that Harry's death is imminent, with that idea that his lifelines are short. It's not inaccurate, though.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: If you think about it, there was like a point at which Harry made a choice in the seventh book, the very end -- a choice to live or to not -- so it was an option.

Lorrie: That reinforces what Harry and Oliver Wood are talking about, where Oliver Wood goes, "Why? Why is it being stripped down?" and Harry's like, "Uh, supposedly Voldemort's after me," and they both just go "ugh" and carry on with the real business of life, which is Quidditch. If you are doomed, what are you going to do about it? Just go about your business.

JC: Yeah. Yeah, that's true.

Lorrie: So we get Lupin setting up this class for Harry, and he says about the boggart: "I can store him in my office when we're not using him; there's a cupboard under my desk he'll like." That is so charming.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: You do want to consider the boggart, too.

JC: Yeah, and that says a lot about Lupin, that he himself being part dark creature or whatever understands what it's like, and I love that show of empathy for these creatures. Compare that to the previous year with pixies. I almost said 'piskies'.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: With the 'piskie' -- I did it again!

Lorrie: Well, that's the word that originally it was before it got switched to 'pixie'.

JC: Okay, that's interesting. Yeah. Mmm, linguistics.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: So the pixies... Lockhart is completely like, "Ugh, they're just these little pesky pests." They're just 'ugh' and they are kind of pesty, but no one is thinking of them as little beings that have feelings or that are sentient in some way. Way back in the second book, I talked at length about the house gnomes, the garden gnomes.

Lorrie: Yes.

JC: And how I just could not believe that they were these little sentient creatures, and the same thing with... oh, my God, what are they called? The plants that scream when you pull them out of their pots?

Lorrie: Oh, the mandrakes.

JC: With the mandrakes last year, as well. The idea that these are little sentient creatures and no one is treating them that way, it just boggled my mind. It's just nice to see Lupin being like, "Oh, yeah, the boggart has feelings, too, and I'm going to take good care of it. It's going to help us out with this, I'm going to store it in a place. It'll be happy in between."

Lorrie: "Doing us a favor."

JC: There's something really humane about that, that I really appreciate about Lupin here.

Lorrie: Yeah, it's as if Hagrid's attitude toward dangerous creatures were not weird.

JC: Yeah. Hagrid's perspective is because he's so big, I guess. We talked about that before, but he's half giant and he can control things. Well, he thinks he can control things in ways other people can't, or things that are horrific to other people are not horrific to him. He has a different perspective on the world, which we talked about before. Lupin does, too, but he's also he grew up here. He went to this... Well, so did Hagrid, was my point. I don't know. I need more coffee.

Lorrie: Hagrid's boundaries are somewhere else.

JC: Yeah, that's true.

Lorrie: He can afford them to be.

JC: Yeah, yeah. I guess that's true.

Lorrie: So we get the introduction of the Patronus, the anti-dementor, which is the other part of the super valuable invention we get in this volume, this concept that readers can take and use. Any reader of the series can think about what their Patronus might look like and what memories they might use, and it has entered popular culture. It's good, and Lupin describes it as "a kind of positive force, a projection of the very things that the dementor feeds upon -- hope, happiness, the desire to survive." These things, if they're in you, the dementor can trap them and feed on them. If you project them into a Patronus, that's a more protected way to take what makes you strong and let it guide you. Have you thought about what form your Patronus might take?

JC: Yes, and I always thought it would be a cat, because I love cats. There was a time when we all used to say "Such and such is my spirit animal," before we understood that that's actually racist and we shouldn't say that and appropriative.

Lorrie: We don't get one, yeah.

JC: But that idea of replacing it became really popular. It's probably 15 years ago that it became really popular to say, "Okay, replace that with '\_\_\_ is my Patronus'," because that's the same feeling that people want but without the racism and appropriation. That idea of "What's your Patronus," I remember being a big thing about 15 years ago. For me, I've always had a connection with cats. I was always like a little kid who, if there were some wild kittens in the wood pile at some aunt's house, in half an hour I'd have them in my lap, purring. I'd be scratched up, but have purring kittens in my lap. I'm always that person who goes to someone's house and their cat comes over and gets in my lap, and they're like, "Oh, my God, they never approach strangers."

Lorrie: "The cat never does that."

JC: Yeah, no, I'm a cat person. Cat, for sure. Maybe one with stripes. It would have... You know how it would have very subtle markings, a Patronus would?

Lorrie: Yes.

JC: Very subtle stripes.

Lorrie: Have you thought about what memories you might use to summon a Patronus?

JC: A lot. I feel very fortunate to have a lot of really incredible memories in my life, and they change over time, which is interesting.

Lorrie: Yes.

JC: So yeah. Yeah. Many. It's hard to know where to start. It makes me feel blessed even to think about the fact that I don't know where to start, unlike Harry. It would... yeah, yeah.

Lorrie: Yeah. Or Lupin.

JC: Or Lupin, right.

Lorrie: But yeah, the way that the first book lets the reader be a participant so much... What kind of wand would you have? How would you react? I think determining your Patronus is another one of those portals into really bonding with this series and the world that it creates.

JC: What would your Patronus be?

Lorrie: I was never quite sure, but then last year -- six months ago -- I decided to overcome a lifelong terror of being photographed, a lifelong recoiling from my own image. I thought, 'I have to do this, I have to get over it,' so I went to this photographer Kristin Reimer, whom I actually met because she was hired to be the staff photographer for MISTI-Con last year. She does these amazing portraits where she gets you to visualize a fantasy self that will make you feel strong, and then she'll work with you to create that portrait. I told her, "I want you to make me look like the witch who lives in the woods who everyone is scared of, but you have to go to her if you want potions that work. And then when you go to meet her, she's actually really nice, but you probably still shouldn't make her mad." That was my prompt, and darned if she didn't do exactly what I asked! She, at one point, handed me this plastic crow; she just handed it to me and I instantly fell in love. In the pictures that work the best, I'm there with that crow, and I thought, "You know what? This is my Patronus now, I guess."

JC: That's amazing. It chose you.

Lorrie: Lupin explains to Harry that this is highly advanced magic, and a lot of adults have trouble with it. We see that Lupin is one of those adults who has trouble with it, and Hermione will always be one of those, too; but when we know this about the Patronus charm and then we see the way Harry learns to cast it, this is the evidence we have that Harry is really gifted, at least in defense. Lupin explains to him that the 'Expecto Patronum' incantation will only work "if you're concentrating, with all your might, on a single, very happy memory." We see later on that this isn't strictly true once you know how to cast it, once it's under your belt, but this is what you should do to focus to start on. Do you want to go ahead with talking about the lesson, or shall I?

JC: Oh, I do have one thing to say before we get started.

Lorrie: Okay. Yeah, go ahead.

JC: I said this earlier: Hermione knows what Lupin is, but doesn't seem particularly worried about him, and that really stood out to me here because he's going to be in a room alone with Lupin. Granted, it's not the full moon or whatever, but Hermione doesn't seem to register any concern about that. No one is concerned.

Lorrie: Right.

JC: That idea that even though Hermione knows that Lupin is a werewolf... she doesn't distrust him completely. She doesn't think he's going to harm Harry. That's such an interesting contrast to the broom, where the broomstick was instantly like, 'Oh, no, this is an object of suspicion. This has to be checked out thoroughly.' She doesn't feel the same way about Lupin. I guess Lupin protected them on the train at the beginning of the year, so I find that interesting, that there's this idea of trust there. Hermione's not worried about Lupin at this point, not about him hurting Harry in this context.

Lorrie: Well, I think that's really topical, because it's not that Hermione hasn't wondered if Lupin is dangerous; it's that she has tested it out in her mind thoroughly, and she feels that she knows him. She knows that he's trustworthy, which is why, for a moment later on when she finds out that there's reason to suspect him, she feels angry and betrayed.

JC: Yeah, that makes sense.

Lorrie: That's exactly what's going on with Lupin when he is not revealing what he knows about Sirius in attempt to catch him, because even though he has ample evidence to be worried that Sirius has committed crimes and has turned, it's so discordant with what he knows in his heart of the person. He really does not have the conviction to go ahead with what everybody's supposed to be doing -- casting him as evil and going out to catch him -- and I think that's actually the same process that Hermione is using with this knowledge observing Lupin, especially because we get that moment of betrayal later. It definitely reminds me of the betrayal and hurt that readers feel when we trusted J.K. Rowling to be on the side of empathy and good, and then we find out that no, she's going to campaign against trans rights, and that "I trusted you" feeling. Right now, Hermione is consciously evaluating Lupin and consciously deciding that she trusts him. We get three different attempts in this chapter of Harry finding a memory that he thinks is happy and testing out this new charm. His first memory is his first broomstick ride, and he gets "a wisp of silver". That is phenomenal on his first attempt to get anything; it's not enough, but who knows how far he could have gotten on the first attempt with any memory. He tries this memory on the boggart and he gets an instant flashback to his mother being killed; Lupin looks paler than usual when he observes this and says, "Harry, if you don't want to continue, I will more than understand." Oh no, Harry's not having any of this.

JC: He's been waiting a long time, and Quidditch is on the line.

Lorrie: Quidditch. Yes. "How am I going to play Quidditch if we don't do this?"

JC: Exactly. That's the motivation. Oh, my God.

Lorrie: Yeah, and that's the beginning of this very delicately sketched dance that we see partially between the teacher and the student here that I love. It shows how teaching is a process between two people. It's not an impartial expert imparting knowledge and the student just receiving it; it's constantly being evaluated. The teacher's history is informing all the choices that they make, as well as what they judge about the students that they're teaching to try to get the message to them. But also, the teacher is the adult and can't indulge themselves by revealing everything that's going through their mind to the student, so Lupin has to do all this processing on his own, including when he has doubts. He is a human and he is responding to this in a human emotional way, but he has to do the best he can. He's also making this lesson up as he goes along, because it's really not for 13-year-olds, but this is a special case.

JC: Right.

Lorrie: So yeah, here we're watching a teacher making it up on the fly and having their own feelings, and not putting them on the student.

JC: Everything that you just said... It's amazing. I do teacher education for my job, and one of the big tenets of the program that I'm in, and of many programs, is that good teaching is based on relationships. It's the relationship between the teacher and the students -- between the teacher and individual students, between the students and each other -- that make a classroom. If a kid in your room doesn't feel like they have a good relationship with the teacher or with the kids that are sitting around them, that child cannot learn. Your brain just shuts down. You can't do it.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: How important it is for teachers to be able to do what you just described every day... The emotional work of teaching, the emotional labor involved, is something that a lot of people don't understand; if you don't understand that, you're just never going to be a good teacher. You're just not.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: I love that the series positions Lupin as a very natural teacher. He's a very good teacher, and even though he makes poor choices (as we have discussed in earlier chapters) he learns from those; you see him improving over the course of the year, like you would expect a new teacher at a school to do, so I love the depiction of teaching through the portrayal of Lupin in this book.

Lorrie: He improves in the areas where he can, thus highlighting the areas where he hasn't been. So that memory does okay, and we learn Harry's baseline, which is phenomenal. Then he tries again, and his second memory is winning the House Championship and that's not bad. This time, he gets another flashback that goes deeper and he hears his father, too, during that traumatic confrontation; when he comes out of the flashback, when Lupin gets him out of the flashback, he finds that he's been crying. Lupin is even more hesitant because, of course, Lupin hears about James and has to deal with his own feelings, but manages.

JC: This is where I started crying, by the way.

Lorrie: Yeah. Because no matter what revelations he's having about this poor little 13-year-old in front of him, he is the only thing that's standing between Harry and possibly mastering this really important tool, so he is going to have to have his feelings later.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: He says, "All right, ready?" and Lupin "looked as though he were doing this against his better judgment." Yeah, again, I love that delicate portrayal of how he has to sift through everything every minute to figure out "What am I doing as a teacher? Let's try this. Okay," standing ready to stop it if he needs to. The other thing, though, as we're looking at this process, is the realization I had quite recently that this is the exact same process that Snape uses for the Occlumency lessons later in Book Five.

JC: Interesting.

Lorrie: Which took me years to see that, because common reader response is that this Patronus lesson is really good and that the Occlumency lessons are a fiasco.

JC: But they're not that different. Okay, again, what's different is the feelings the two people have for each other.

Lorrie: That's part of it. The other part of it is that once Snape realized that Voldemort was monitoring, he couldn't go on with them, but he had to pretend to, because stopping them once he realized that would have also been bad. What Lupin is doing is what Snape was on his way to doing before Voldemort realized that the lessons were happening and then pulled up a chair. It's the same thing where you give the theory and then you let the students show what their baseline is, and then you make attempts and you tinker trying to find what's more and what's less effective for this particular student. Lupin, after he sets the baseline for Harry, he is letting Harry -- as Snape does with the Occlumency lessons -- find his way through trial and error to identifying what kind of feelings best fuel this charm. Okay, the first broomstick ride, it's a solo thing; it's about his true nature. The House Championship has more community to it; we're getting there, it's stronger. Then when Harry tries the third memory, he's leaving the Dursleys; that's a bit more like "Somebody knows about you, Harry. You're going to go someplace with people where you belong; they didn't forget you." This is the time that Harry makes that breakthrough where he can have a flashback and still, at the same time, hold on to the present, which is so huge. Anyone who suffers from this kind of traumatic response knows how huge it is to be able to hold on to yourself and to the present, even while those memories come back. They don't rule you. For Harry to have achieved that after only the third try on his first lesson really shows you this kid is something special, which also makes you realize, wow, Lupin is going to love this child forever because he really sees what Harry's made of, and this is way more than anybody could expect from anyone of any age. But wow, especially considering what he's struggling against: the memories that he's trying to be strong enough to permit back into his consciousness. This is no joke... Look at him reaching inside and finding something in himself! That's when Lupin sets a firm boundary over and against Harry's objections and says, "You've had enough for one night." That's so reassuring, when the grown-up knows where to set the boundary, and not out of fear. Not for their own weird, projecting reasons, but because they have judgment. That's my initial assessment of how this extraordinary lesson goes. What about you?

JC: You're going to laugh. This is probably very typical of me re-reading this series. The big question that popped into my head, almost right away, was what is a boggart? Does it really turn into a dementor? Why is Harry responding to it as if it were a real dementor? Is it really sucking the happiness out of him? How is the magic working in this scene, is my question, and my guess is that you're probably going to say it doesn't matter from a story perspective. Here I am, grounded in the details of this world, and I'm like, "But what's really happening here?" I don't know what's happening there.

Lorrie: I think it does matter.

JC: Yeah? Does it?

Lorrie: Especially when we see what happens later, when Harry sees himself casting a Patronus. That mentally does something to him to enable him to do it again, even though he doesn't really think he's ever done it before. It's that line that we get from Dumbledore at the very end in King's Cross: "Yes, it's happening in your head, but why does it make it not real?"



JC: Oooh, uh-huh.

Lorrie: To put it really baldly: when you're having a trauma flashback, is it really happening to you again? No, of course not. Does your entire body and mind believe that it's happening all over again? Yes. That's why flashbacks are so horrendous, so exhausting, and such a bad thing to suffer from, and why it's so important to try to get treatment and relief from them. It doesn't matter that they're not happening; you are experiencing them as though they really are. I think that's the helpful way that Lupin is using Harry's response to even the thought of a dementor as, "Okay, good. We don't need to get a real one. We can just get something that I can control." At any point, Lupin can get the boggart to stop being a dementor, but when he needs it to be, he can recreate those psychological conditions for Harry in order for Harry to work on them and be treated. It's just really good, controlled laboratory conditions.

JC: Yeah, that makes sense. Yeah, that makes sense. I think the other thing is thinking about this... I think the first time I read this, I'm sure I was in Harry's POV. This time, it was so easy to think about Lupin and what Lupin was feeling during all this. I think that's why I started crying. When Harry tells Lupin that he heard James's voice, I'm like, "Oh, my God."

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: What must Lupin be thinking here? That's the point in which he's like, "Okay, we can stop. We don't have to keep going." Harry's like, "Nooooo," because Harry's thinking Quidditch, and Lupin is going, "Oh, my God, he relived the death of his parents and I knew his parents." I could just imagine Lupin after this, going back to his room, collapsing on his bed and just thinking, 'What the hell? What the hell has this kid been through?' This is the first time, probably, that Lupin has heard an account of what happened.

Lorrie: True.

JC: Everyone has a sense of it, but Harry actually remembers it.

Lorrie: Harry was there.

JC: Yeah. Oh, God, just how... it's hard for me not to put myself in Lupin's position there.

Lorrie: Also, how there's a fantasy that makes me angry. Adults often like to fantasize that there's some things that happen so young that children won't remember them.

JC: Oof, yeah.

Lorrie: And I'm somebody who remembers. I remember my first birthday. And things that people feel guilty about that I witnessed -- that they hope that I forgot -- I didn't.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: I don't. This fantasy that, "Look at Harry Potter and all the horrible things he's been through; maybe they didn't hurt him that much, maybe he doesn't remember." Oh, he remembers. Oh, yes, they did hurt him. The awfulness of that moment, Lupin is face to face with it for the first time, but Harry lives it every day and he needs Lupin right now. Whatever shock Lupin is going through as he's confronted with this extraordinary, pitiable, awful tragedy, he just has to catch himself up really fast because the kid needs him now, so Lupin does. He gets

himself up to scratch really fast. He shows up for the kid, and if he has to go home and cry later... Well, yeah, that's what being a parent or a teacher or any sort of responsible elder is like.

JC: That's probably why I was identifying so hard with him in that scene, because I recognized what he was doing there in a way that I don't think I recognized fifteen... however many years ago I read this. I didn't recognize it as sharply, so yeah.

Lorrie: Yeah. Yeah.

JC: Ah, yeah.

Lorrie: Yeah, you've got to be good at your job and make yourself be there. Process later.

JC: Yeah, for sure. There have been times -- and I know that you had them, too, and probably people listening who are our age -- where we're either working with a student, or talking to my own child, where I had to walk away and process later, so that feeling is so real. So real.

Lorrie: Yeah, and you have to not scream, "You did what?! Whoa, whoa, whoa. Go back for a sec." No, do that later.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: Oi.

JC: Especially when it's your own kid, obviously, it's critically important. But when it's other people's kids, then yeah, you have to have this veneer of professionalism there.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: But also, one of the things that I think is really interesting about being a teacher, being in the position that Lupin is in, is this 'in loco parentis' feeling of, "This is not my kid, but I'm responsible for this child."

Lorrie: "But it's not anyone else's kid, either, because I know what happened to them." Yeah.

JC: Well, yeah, in that case, for sure. But this idea of... I'm trying to figure out how to put this into words. I am the adult here; when it's somebody else's kid, it's easy to go, "Well, that kid's got problems." But when you're the teacher or the caregiver in that situation, it's like, "Okay, there's no one else. I have to be the one to handle this." It's almost like this psychological version of coming across an accident scene and realizing there's no one else to help. I have to do it.

Lorrie: I'm the adult, yeah.

JC: I have to call 9-1-1, I have to staunch the bleeding, I have to do the things. The psychological version of that... teachers will often find themselves in that role. You have to be the grown-up. I see Lupin doing that here, and I'm like, "Oh, my God."

Lorrie: Right.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: Part of that is you have to have boundaries going into it, because it will be a mistake to give yourself over to it completely. If you do that, if you let yourself get really wrapped up in this

mission and take it on as your own complete mission, you will actually fail the kid. You're a teacher, but you're not the parent. Lupin does, I think, a really good job of maintaining that boundary. Later on, when Sirius becomes the godfather, Sirius, quite rightly, does not have the same boundary; he is the godfather. That's a difference that Lupin and Sirius are really good about observing. Meanwhile, he has to go back and try to think what this means for himself and for his friends, trying to re-analyze their shared history. Harry says, "If you knew my dad, you must've known Sirius Black as well," and Lupin loses it.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: "Lupin turned very quickly. 'Yes, I knew him.... Or I thought I did.'" There we have it: the thing that you pointed out with Hermione thinking, 'Can I trust Lupin?' We see people, we know them. Can we trust what we think we know?

JC: It does make it look, to a first-time reader, like Lupin has something to hide here. When you know what's going on, you can read it differently, but it is interesting that that bit reads both ways. Harry doesn't seem to notice.

Lorrie: Yeah, but the reader is being given a feast here. This is a mystery; this is the part where we get to expand all the things that the reader should be on the alert for. This is fun. "Ooh, what is he hiding? Read more closely for clues; we don't know yet." But the mystery has just been expanded. Why is Lupin acting like this? It must be intense, whatever it is.

JC: And then, the relief when he realizes that Harry's not accusing him of anything. Yeah.

Lorrie: One of the things that I think is so brilliant about this chapter, and the writing of this whole episode, is the conflict Harry feels. "Terrible though it was to hear his parents' last moments replayed inside his head, these were the only times Harry had heard their voices since he was a very small child." There's this confusion. Is he supposed to be wanting to hear them? Is he supposed to be somehow virtuous and self-denying and just shut himself off? Which comes up again later when Dumbledore dies and Hermione says, "You still have to do what Dumbledore told you and resist the connection with Voldemort." But Harry going, "I don't know, there's something I want there." In this case, it's not so much that the memories of hearing his parents' voices are destructive; it's that the incident of trauma is so damaging. But you can't tell Harry Potter, "Don't continue to integrate your memories. Don't continue to uncover who you are and to be yourself." You can't tell anyone that, especially this kid who is the poster child for how imperative it is for a person to know who they are, and how nothing else can really be important if that's the issue that's consuming you at the moment. These are his memories; they belong to him. These are his parents that were taken from him, but he can't remember them without this agony. Okay, Lupin is here to try to give whatever advice Lupin can about how to strengthen yourself so that you can go in and be reunited with what's yours. I'm sure Lupin is also remembering whatever feelings he had about being a small child being turned into a werewolf, and how sometimes those memories are just too awful and you don't want them, but they're you. What can be powerful enough to offset the horror that comes with reliving these traumatic memories? Well, Lupin, you're up. You have to see if you can provide Harry with some help here.

JC: It also stood out to me when Harry was thinking through, 'Should I want to hear these voices? Do I feel guilty about that?' Contrasting that with first year Harry who sat in front of the Mirror of Erised -- who didn't know what it was looking at but wanted it so desperately -- this is

Harry two years later who's more mature, who understands a lot more about the world and understands more about the losses that he's experienced in his life. I think it's interesting he's able to think about that in a different way than he was when he sat in front of the mirror.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: Even though, when he sat in front of the mirror, that was real to him, too. He didn't know that it was whatever it was, but whatever, however... it's all in his head.

Lorrie: Well, yeah, that longing is uncontrollable. It's beyond words. You can't not have it, but what can you do to be strong and survive it, and not to deny it? Dumbledore's answer is treat it with caution; not ignore it, not pretend you don't feel it, and certainly don't give into it completely, because oh, it's dangerous.

JC: And he is doing that here, which is really interesting that he's following Dumbledore's advice. He is treating it with caution; he's thinking through it, and he doesn't blindly take the advice of other people in the moment, as you mentioned with Hermione later on.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: He really thinks through. There's something inside him that he trusts; even when other people around him are saying, "No, no, no, don't do that," there's still this little spark of, "This still feels right to me, and I'm going to follow this with caution." That's incredible!

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: It's incredible, and that goes back to everything that we hate that the author has been doing. You've got this little spark in you. "This is right for me, no matter what everybody around me is telling me." Ugh!

Lorrie: Somebody else thinks they know; they don't know.

JC: Yeah. Yeah.

Lorrie: His first memory, that he remembers himself flying on a broomstick, is relevant, too, because that's his native self. That's Harry Potter, with or without Voldemort's scar; he's fighting to live the life that he was meant to live, to be the person he was meant to be. Why is he taking these lessons? He wants to get back on his broom.

JC: Yeah.

Lorrie: He's good at Quidditch, he likes Quidditch. He should get to be a person. This is half of the answer to the question that is never explicitly answered: Why did Dumbledore hire Lupin this year? One of the answers is because Lupin knows Sirius Black, and Dumbledore is calling on that love magic to be able to solve something about Sirius that nobody else can solve. The other answer is Lupin can do this for Harry. Lupin understands what it's like to have something so traumatic in your past that you need extra strength to be able to assimilate it and be a whole person. He knows that it's not guaranteed that you can succeed. Sometimes yes, it's so awful that yeah, maybe you can't do that, but you'll never stop needing to try. And he knew James. So why did he hire Lupin? He hired Lupin to do a couple of things here, and this is Lupin doing one of them. Then Harry says to Lupin that he thinks Sirius deserves to be kissed by a dementor, and I really appreciate Lupin here saying: "'You think so?' said Lupin lightly. 'Do you really think

anyone deserves that?" And then Harry says, "Yes!" defiantly. That's such a good word for that, because yeah, when you want to stand fast to that kind of opinion, you have to keep telling yourself, "Yes, I'm right. Don't challenge me."

JC: Yeah, that moment reminded me of conversations I had with my own kid. Yeah, where my own kid has said things and I'm like, "Don't put that on the internet. We're going to have FBI people knocking on our door." "You can say that, but oh, let's think through that a little bit." Yeah, that adolescent anger and desire to get back at people who've hurt you or have hurt your friends or whatever... It's so adolescent, the way Harry says that. One of the things I really genuinely appreciate about this series is the way that the kids grow up. At every age, it feels true to the age that they are.

Lorrie: Well, I am not an adolescent, and I often have that feeling of, "Oh, that person deserves something really bad." Then I have to think there is a distinction that we have to learn between being that angry at somebody -- which is, in my opinion, neutral; that's a feeling that humans have -- and knowing that that's different from what you actually want as policy...

JC: For sure.

Lorrie: Especially because you could be wrong.

JC: Yeah, true.

Lorrie: And as these people in this volume find out, a lot of them are wrong about a lot of things that they would have given their lives to swear they were right about.

JC: Or someone else's life. Yeah, for sure.

Lorrie: And then we get this tiny and so real moment where Harry thinks, "He would have liked to have told Lupin about the conversations he'd overheard... but it would have involved revealing that he'd gone to Hogsmeade without permission." That's brilliant, too. The dumb little guilts that we have that hold us back, the desires that we feel guilty and unformed about privately, hold us back; we're going to see how this becomes catastrophic for Lupin later in the series by the end of the book. Sometimes, the secrets that you're keeping... Some of them are huge and some of them are not at all, but guilt works that way. What else did you want to say about the lesson?

JC: It stood out to me early on that, when Lupin's first explaining what a Patronus is, he describes it as a 'guardian'; the fact that we later learn what Harry's Patronus is, I think that's a nice way of thinking about a Patronus. He talked about this idea of it being this... You put all of your good feelings and your strength into this thing, and you send it out and it protects you, but the form that it takes is so personal. Harry's case is obviously a connection back to his father. I love that description of it as being a guardian; that idea that inside you, you have the ability to take care of yourself or to take care of the people around you. You can create this guardian for yourself. That's really powerful.

Lorrie: Yeah, and there are things you can do to help yourself find that.

JC: And it takes work.

Lorrie: Oh, it does.

JC: And you have to draw on your strengths and the good things that have happened to you in your life and power through the awful shit, but you can do it.

Lorrie: Yes. On the other hand, practice makes it way easier. It actually helps to practice. After the lesson, we see Hermione exhausted, dealing with her course load; she's working so hard. "Harry saw that she looked almost as tired as Lupin." I love that so much: the parallel between Hermione being an endangered minority and therefore having to work twice as hard and never quite catch up, and Lupin having a physical disability and therefore missing out on a lot of time and having to re-gather his strength to make up for it. Yeah. It's amazing when they achieve close to their full potential, because they do have a lot more barriers than other people, and it's beautifully parallel that they both have trouble casting a Patronus. Everything's a lot more effort for them and they know it, and they don't really complain because they're beyond that; they're too tired. But yeah, love that, and it makes Hermione cranky. Poor thing.

JC: Yeah, as you get when you're stressed and tired.

Lorrie: Yes.

JC: But it also makes me think, 'Okay, is it that Hermione can only use the Time-Turner to go to class? When she's sitting up at 11 PM, can she flip it back to get more homework time?'

Lorrie: No. We see later that she swore to McGonagall that she would use it only for class.

JC: Man. Is that... Ugh.

Lorrie: But that tracks, right? If you're somebody who has to go to college on a full course load, but then you also have to go work several hours at a job, you don't then also get several hours to sleep.

JC: Right. Yeah.

Lorrie: All that time that your classmates are resting or hanging out, you just have to be sleep-deprived.

JC: Yeah. It is funny... The image of Hermione in this year -- Funny is not quite the right word for it, but constantly surrounded by piles of books and parchment. She's always like... a tuft of hair sticking out over this big pile of stuff is my image of her, maybe with the tip of her quill you see scribbling over the top. Yeah. The image is so clear in my head of what that must look like, and how everyone else is going, "Wow, what is she doing?"

Lorrie: Yeah. She's like, "Yes, thank you, shut up." Yeah, and then these two little jerks not talking to her.

JC: Yeah. And then the chapter ends with Harry finally getting his broom back just in time!

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: And the tension of it the night before the big match, or something close to that. Then he immediately goes over to make up with Hermione over this, which I think is really very cute. He wants that to be done; he wants to move on. He's like, "Okay, I got my broom back. Look, you were wrong, I was right. Can we move on now?"

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: Hermione's like, "Ugh." Hermione would probably really like some recognition of the fact that she did do the right thing there.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: She's not going to get it.

Lorrie: She doesn't have time for this.

JC: But it was a relief that he got his broom back, considering the title of the next chapter. Then, the very last thing we get is that Scabbers has disappeared, and there's blood on the sheets and cat hair!

Lorrie: And Ron is not ready to make up with Hermione, and Hermione does not need this. In 2009, I heard a lecture by a Jungian psychotherapist named Mara Tesler Stein about mirrors in the Potterverse that transformed how I saw all mirrors and how they work in this fantasy universe, but especially the Patronus. Mara reads the Patronus as "perhaps the most accurate and revealing mirror in the Potterverse... one that Death Eaters would not only shrink from using if they could, but are, according to Rowling (with one notable exception) incapable of using at all." Mara says, from the Jungian perspective, "Mirrors give us a point of view that we would be otherwise unable to obtain. Without the capacity to reflect, we have no avenue through which to see ourselves." A mirror shows us something about ourselves that we can see, but we wouldn't know about it if we didn't have that out there for us to see and to think about. Mara says, "In order to understand the nature of the Patronus as a mirror, we need to spend a moment reflecting on souls and memory.... The *external* mirrors in the Potterverse (such as a Patronus) provide avenues for insight, pathways to find the sparks. But they can't reflect the essential wholeness of a person (and) they aren't meant to. Memory originates *inside* a person and can be extracted and viewed, providing an accurate mirror of events, even revealing more than the subject was conscious of at the time. Memory, with all its attendant emotion, also serves as fuel for the Patronus Charm. Harry's early attempts to conjure a Patronus fail" not only because it's difficult... "but more specifically because the memories Harry tries to use aren't suited for this particular enchantment." Mara's reading is that to reach a Patronus, the memories that are about human connection are the ones that are going to get you the Patronus Charm more than the ones that are about yourself, more than the ones about beating the other three Houses for the House Cup. That's something that Harry experiences more and more throughout the series, and it actually turns out to be the exact same answer for the Occlumency lessons. What makes Occlumency work is the exact same thing, only a Patronus, you project it outward for yourself and for others to see. For Occlumency, you do it inward to protect your mind. Mara says, "How is it that love can provide such powerful protection? Feeling love and being loved by another are the building blocks of a person and provide us with resilience against emotional assault. During the earliest days of childhood -- those months, for example, that Harry spent being cared for by his parents -- the gleam of pleasure in a *parent's* eye acts as our first and most powerful mirror. It's a mirror that reflects not precisely *me*, but the delight that is conjured as if by magic in *you because of me*. It's a mirror that reflects no less than the connection between two souls." Harry's Patronus is fueled by memories of love. These memories are difficult for him to access without trauma, but he craves them; they are his. Lupin is teaching Harry to amplify the protective love within these memories to help combat the damage of trauma. Shutting off your memories when they come with trauma, that's a good temporary tactic

when it's not safe to access them. But if you're in a safe position where you can, then this is a way to reinforce yourself so you can claim what's yours.

JC: It really stands out to me, that idea of being able to take the power of the love that you have for others or that others have for you, and being able to use that to power protection for yourself against your traumas. That's really, really powerful to think about, not only in the context of this series but in the context of life.

Lorrie: Right.

JC: What does it take to heal from a trauma? What do you need as a human? And that idea that you're never too broken.

Lorrie: Yeah.

JC: You can always learn how to protect yourself from it, and how to heal and develop relationships with other people. Yeah.

Lorrie: It takes work.

JC: Yes, that's hard and takes work.

Lorrie: What Mara said -- that this mirror reflects no less than the connection between two souls -- when you just mentioned that you're never too broken: that's what Voldemort latches onto when he sees his pain mirrored in baby Harry's loss that he just caused. Later on, when Voldemort takes Harry's blood and they are connected, and they form the golden connection between them that lifts them both off the ground, that's what Voldemort is experiencing. Harry is a mirror for him, and that is an intensity that Voldemort doesn't know what to do with. But he keeps chasing this child Harry Potter, because whether he knows it or not, he's chasing the possibility that this can heal him, more of that connection, and it hurts. It hurts in a way that he never felt before he had a connection with another person. So yeah, you can see why Voldemort might want to kill Harry and make the pain stop. But also, that pain is where his wholeness potentially lies, so he's going to want to keep going after it. He can't stop himself. Voldemort sure had a lot less to work with than Harry did, through no fault of his own. But yeah, this is Remus Lupin teaching Harry how to cast a Patronus and proving that it's not being an expert in a skill that makes you a good teacher; it's knowing how to teach, and knowing that teaching is always a process between two people, taking responsibility for your part in it as an adult, doing what you can do to be there for the kid, judging how the kid is responding to the lesson, and adjusting it as you go along. Next chapter: Gryffindor Versus Ravenclaw.

JC: All right. Quidditch!

Lorrie: All this work is for Quidditch, so we may as well have a Quidditch match!

JC: Quidditch! All right.

Lorrie: All right, talk to you then.

JC: Okay. Yay! Bye.

Caroline: You've been listening to Harry Potter After 2020 with hosts Lorrie Kim and JC. You can find show notes for this and all other episodes at [HPAfter2020.com](http://HPAfter2020.com). There, you will also find ways to support the show, contact the hosts and more. If you like what you heard, consider



giving us a review on Apple Podcasts or wherever you get your podcasts. Harry Potter After 2020 is produced and edited by Lorrie Kim and Caroline Rinaldy. Original music was composed by C.L. Smith. Thank you for listening.